

Ref No: SA/09/147

Date: 27-02-2009

Mr. Amir Saeed,
The Project Director,
University Karachi,
Karachi.

TENDER EVALUATION FOR BIDS OF THE PROPOSED PROJECT
"CONSTRUCTION OF INSTITUTE OF SUSTAINABLE
HALOPHYTE UTILIZATION (ISHU) 1ST FLOOR

TENDER SCRUTINY REPORT

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to your letter # P&D/Helophyte/023-09 dated February 02 2009. The tender for the project were issued to Thirteen (13) Contractors, only seven (07) participated in the competition. As per schedule the tenders were received and opened in the office of the Planning and development department. The original tenders were received by us on 02nd February 2009 for scrutiny.

The names of the contracting firms and the amount quoted by them are given below.

Positions as per tender openings statements before scrutiny:

S #	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
01.	M/S. Pentagrams	7.70%	11,955,504.00	1 st Lowest
02.	M/S. Pak Arabian Construction Company	-	13,984,870.00	2 nd Lowest
03.	M /S. Landmark	-	14,164,738.00	3 rd Lowest
04.	M/S. Asghar Ali & Co.	3.38%	15,134,815.69	4 th Lowest
05.	M/S. Waqar & Co	-	15,607,034.20	5 th Lowest

Cont...

S #	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
06.	M/S. Precise Constructors	8.00%	15,865,656.00	6 th Lowest
07.	M/S. Amir Ahmed & Co.	-	16,343,510.93	7 th Lowest

After scrutiny and arithmetic check, the bid amount changed as given below:

S #	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
01.	M/S. Pentagrams	7.70%	11,951,144.67	1 st Lowest
02.	M/S. Landmark	-	13,893,839.64	2 nd Lowest
03.	M/S. Pak Arabian Construction Company	-	14,127,026.62	3 rd Lowest
04.	M/S. Asghar Ali & Co.	3.38%	15,134,819.40	4 th Lowest
05.	M/S. Waqar & Co.	-	15,607,034.20	5 th Lowest
06.	M/S. Precise Constructors	8.00%	15,865,655.82	6 th Lowest
07.	M/S. Amir Ahmed & Co.		16,614,758.84	7 th Lowest

The difference in the total tendered cost of different Contractors is given below.

S#	DIFFERENCE BETWEEN	AMOUNT (PKR)	PERCENTAGE
01.	1 st and 2 nd Lowest	1,489,510.65	13.98%
02.	2 nd and 3 rd Lowest	233,186.98	1.65%
03.	3 rd and 4 th Lowest	1,007,792.78	6.66%
04.	4 th and 5 th Lowest	472,214.80	3.03%

OBSERVATIONS:

It has been noted that three contractors (1). M/S. Pentagrams, (2). M/S. Landmarks and (3). M/S. M/S. Pak Arabian Construction Company have quoted "lump sum" cost for Fiber Tank instead of Per. Gallon rates. This minor deviation from the "Instructions to Bidders" is apparently an oversight and may be overlooked.

The provisions of Para IB.27 (b) are not considered applicable here.

cont...

1. M/S. Pentagrams are the 1st lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has decreased from Rs. 11,955,504.00 to Rs. 11,951,144.67 due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are about 13.98% lower than the 2nd lowest bidder. Over writings and cutting in quoted rates have been observed on Pages # 9,10,11,17, 20, 23 and summary.
2. M /S. Landmark are the 2nd lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has decreased from Rs. 14,164,738.00 to Rs. 13,893,839.64 due to calculations errors and their position has changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 1.65% lower than 3rd lowest bidder.
3. M/S. Pak Arabian Co. are the 3rd lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 13,984,870.00 to Rs. 14,127,026.62 due to calculations errors and their position has changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 6.66% lower than 4th bidder. Over writings and cutting in quoted rates have been observed on Pages # 15 & Summary.

Moreover it has been observed during scrutiny of M/S. Pak Arabian Co. that which items were stated according Pak. PWD Scheduled Items 2004, Contractor quoted different rates separately upon each items with major variation and high percentage. Such alteration, revision and modification are not up to standard method and acceptable. Therefore it is recommended to eliminate the following contractors.

4. M/S. Asghar Ali & Co. are the 4th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 15,134,815.69 to Rs. 15,134,819.40 but their position has not been changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 3.03% lower than 5th lowest bidder. Cutting and over writings in quoted rates have been observed on Pages # 16,18 & summary.

RECOMMENDATION:

Though the bid of M/S. Pentagrams (RS. 11,951,144.67) is the lowest, it is 15.08% lower than the estimated cost. They may be asked to confirm workability of their rates before award of work.

In case the fail to satisfy Employer the 2nd lowest M/S. Landmark (RS. 13,893,839.64) may be considered for award of work. Their rates are 1.27% lower than the Cost Estimates.

We are returning herewith original tenders (07 Nos.) of the above noted tenderers, duly scrutinized by us. This is for your information and further necessary action.

Thanking You,

Yours Faithfully,
For **SHAHZAD ASSOCIATES**

(Engr. KARAM A. SIDDIQUI)

Enclosed:

1. Annexure - A, Tender Opening Statement
2. Annexure - B, Tender Scrutiny Statement
3. Original tenders (07 Nos.)