CONSULTING ARCHITECTS, ENGINEERS & PLANNERS Karachi Off: 2nd Floor, Farzana Building, Shaheed-e-Millat Road, Karachi TEL: 4384591, 4388857 FAX: 4530754 E-MAIL: shahzadarch@yahoo.com slaamabed Off: Room No. 8, Zeidar Shopping Plaza, Bahrahkouh, Islamabed. TEL: 051-4314284 Quetta Off: 4-B, 1st Floor, Hassen Appartments, Patel Bagh, Quetta. Ph: 081-2005215

Ref No:

SA/09/628

Date:

03-08-2009

Engr. Amir Saeed Project Director (Sports), University of Karachi, Karachi.

TENDER EVALUATION OF BIDS FOR THE PROPOSED PROJECT "PROVISIONS OF SPORTS FACILITIES" AT UNIVERSITY OF KARACHI UNIVERSITY

CONSTRUCTION OF NEW GYMNASIUM BUILDING & FITNESS CENTER

TENDER SCRUTINY REPORT

Dear Sir,

The tender for the project were issued to Six (06) Contractors, only Four (04) participated in the competition. The original tenders were received by us on 23^{rd} June 2009 for scrutiny. The names of the contracting firms and the amount quoted by them are given below.

Positions as per tender opening statements before scrutiny:

s #	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
01.	M/S. Bali Builders	<u>-</u>	27,261,871.61	Lowest
02.	M/S. A.K. Enterprises	2,446,782.57	29,985,270.16	2 nd Lowest
03.	M/S. Pak Arabian Construction Co.	-	32,382,783.17	3 rd Lowest
04.	M/S. Al-Tariq Constructors (Pvt.) Limited.		37,062,734.00	4 th Lowest

Cont...



After scrutiny and checking of calculations, the bid amount changed as given below:

S#	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
01.	M/S. Bali Builders	•	27,280,047.42	Lowest
02.	M/S. A.K. Enterprises		32,005,429.73	2 nd Lowest
03.	M/S. Pak Arabian Construction Co.	<u>-</u>	33,495,538.00	3 rd Lowest
04.	M/S. Al-Tariq Constructors (Pvt.) Limited.	, -	37,080,773.00	4 th Lowest

The difference in the total tendered cost of different Contractors is given below.29914395.89

S#	DIFFERENCE BETWEEN	AMOUNT (PKR)	PERCENTAGE 14.76%	
01.	1 st and 2 nd Lowest	4,725,382.31		
02.	2 nd and 3 rd Lowest	1,490,108.27	4.44%	
03.	3 rd and 4 th Lowest	3,585,235.00	9.66%	

OBSERVATIONS:

- 1. M/S. Bali Builders are the 1st lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 27,261,871.61 to Rs. 27,280,047.42 (difference Rs. +18,175.81) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 14.76% lower than 2nd bidder. Over writing and cuttings in quoted rates have been observed on Gymnasium B.O.Q Page # 11, 27, 28, summary and Fitness Center B.O.Q Page # 10, 17, 20.
- 2. M/S. A.K. Enterprises are the 2nd lowest tender. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 29,985,270.16 to Rs. 32,005,429.73 (difference Rs. +2,020,159.57) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 4.44% lower than 3rd bidder. Over writing and cuttings in quoted rates have been observed on Gymnasium B.O.Q Page # 14.
- 3. M/S. Pak Arabian Construction Co. are the 3^{rd} lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 32,382,783.17 to Rs. 33,495,538.00 (difference Rs. +1,112,754.83) but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 9.66% lower than 4^{th} bidder.



4. M/S. Al-Tariq Constructors are the 4th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 37,062,734.00 to Rs. 37,080,773.00 (difference Rs. +18,039.00) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. Over writing and cuttings in quoted rates have been observed on Fitness Center B.O.Q Page # 21.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The bid of M/S. Bali Builders is the lowest, it is 8.80% lower than the Estimated Cost. The Contractors were requested to provide the Rate Analysis and samples for Wood Flooring to ensure the workability of the rate for that item, as this involves a substantial amount.

Though the Contractors have provided the Rate Analysis and sample of the wooden flooring, to ensure the quality and durability of floor the Contractor may be asked to furnish a guarantee of defect free usage for at least five years after the completion. If the Contractors accede to the above conditions, they may be considered for award of work.

We are returning herewith original tenders (4 Nos) of the above noted tenderers, duly scrutinized by us for your information and further action.

Thanking You,

Yours Faithfully,

For SHAHZAD ASSOCIATES

(AKMAL JAMAL)

CC. Director (P&D) University of Karachi.

Enclosed:

1. Annexure - A, Tender Opening Statement

2. Annexure - B, Tender Scrutiny Statement

3. Original Tenders (04 Nos.)