



# SHAHZAD ASSOCIATES

CONSULTING ARCHITECTS, ENGINEERS & PLANNERS  
Karachi Off: 2nd Floor, Farzana Building, Shaheed-e-Millat Road, Karachi  
TEL: 4384591, 4388857 FAX: 4530754 E-MAIL: shahzadarch@yahoo.com  
Islamabad Off: Room No. 8, Zeldar Shopping Plaza, Bahrahkoun, Islamabad. TEL: 051-4314284  
Quetta Off: 4-B, 1st Floor, Hassan Apartments, Patel Bagh, Quetta. Ph: 081-2005215

Ref No: SA/09/588

Date: 21-07-2009

Engr. Amir Saeed  
Project Director (Sports)  
University of Karachi,  
Karachi.

**TENDER EVALUATION OF BIDS FOR THE PROPOSED PROJECT**  
**"PROVISIONS OF SPORTS FACILITIES (REHABILITATION OF**  
**CRICKET GROUND & RENOVATION OF SQUASH COURT)**

**TENDER SCRUTINY REPORT**

Dear Sir,

The tender for the project were issued to Eleven (11) Contractors, only Six (06) participated in the competition. The original tenders were received by us on 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2009 for scrutiny. The names of the contracting firms and the amount quoted by them are given below.

**Positions as per tender opening statements before scrutiny:**

S #	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
01.	M/S. Khalid Jamal Constructor	-	2,963,758.00	Lowest
02.	M/S. Pentagrams	10%	3,033,106.20	2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest
03.	M/S. Tak Engineering Services	-	3,055,000.00	3 <sup>rd</sup> Lowest
04.	M/S. Concraft Pakistan	-	4,143,453.23	4 <sup>th</sup> Lowest
05.	M/S. Modern Dynamic Associates	-	4,156,329.90	5 <sup>th</sup> Lowest
06.	M/S. Warsi Enterprises	-	15,204,525.00	6 <sup>th</sup> Lowest

Cont...



After scrutiny and checking of calculations, the bid amount changed as given below:

S #	NAME OF CONTRACTORS	REBATE	AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR)	POSITION
01.	M/S. Khalid Jamal Constructor	-	3,047,358.17	Lowest
02.	M/S. Pentagrams	10%	3,120,991.14	2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest
03.	M/S. Tak Engineering Services	-	3,188,531.46	3 <sup>rd</sup> Lowest
04.	M/S. Concraft Pakistan	-	4,231,833.23	4 <sup>th</sup> Lowest
05.	M/S. Modern Dynamic Associates	-	4,656,320.63	5 <sup>th</sup> Lowest
06.	M/S. Warsi Enterprises	-	13,882,386.53	6 <sup>th</sup> Lowest

The difference in the total tendered cost of different Contractors is given below.

S#	DIFFERENCE BETWEEN	AMOUNT (PKR)	PERCENTAGE
01.	1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest	73,632.97	2.35%
02.	2 <sup>nd</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> Lowest	67,540.32	2.11%
03.	3 <sup>rd</sup> and 4 <sup>th</sup> Lowest	1,043,301.77	24.65%
04.	4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> Lowest	424,487.40	9.11%
05.	5 <sup>th</sup> and 6 <sup>th</sup> Lowest	9,226,065.90	150.46%

**OBSERVATIONS:**

1. M/S. Khalid Jamal Constructor are the 1<sup>st</sup> lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 2,963,758.00 to Rs. 3,047,358.41 (difference Rs. +83,600.41) but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 2.35% lower than 2<sup>nd</sup> bidder. Cuttings in quoted rates have been observed on Summary Page 'B'.
2. M/S. Pentagrams are the 2<sup>nd</sup> lowest tender. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 3,033,106.20 to Rs. 3,120,991.14 (difference Rs. +87,884.94) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 4.01% lower than 3<sup>rd</sup> bidder.

Cont...



3. M/S. Tak Engineering Services are the 3<sup>rd</sup> lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 3,093,080.00 to Rs. 3,188,531.46 (difference Rs. +95,451.46) but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 24.65% lower than 4<sup>th</sup> bidder.
4. M/S. Concraft Pakistan are the 4<sup>th</sup> lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 4,143,453.00 to Rs. 4,231,833.23 (difference Rs. +88,380.23) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 9.11% lower than 5<sup>th</sup> bidder. Cuttings and Over writing in quoted rates have been observed on Cricket Ground BOQ Page No. 1.
5. M/S. Modern Dynamic Associates are the 5<sup>th</sup> lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 4,156,329.90 to Rs. 4,656,320.63 (difference Rs. +499,991.13) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 150.46% lower than 6<sup>th</sup> bidder. Over writing and cutting in quoted rates have been observed on Cricket Ground BOQ Page No. 1.
6. M/S. Warsi Enterprises are the 6<sup>th</sup> lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has decreased from Rs. 15,204,525.00 to Rs. 13,882,386.53 (difference Rs. -1,322,138.47) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Though the bid of M/S. Khalid Jamal Constructor is the lowest, but it is 13.14% higher than the Estimated Cost. The tender have been further reviewed and it has been noticed that the rates quoted by them are higher in comparison to the prevalent market rates.

They may be asked to offer additional rebate in the interest of Project, so that overall cost is further reduced. It is recommended that after rebate the work may be awarded to them.

We are returning herewith original tenders (6 Nos) of the above noted tenderers, duly scrutinized by us. This is for your information and further necessary action.

Thanking You,

Yours Faithfully,  
For **SHAHZAD ASSOCIATES**

**(AKMAL JAMAL)**

CC. Director (P&D) University of Karachi.

*Enclosed:*

1. Annexure - A, Tender Opening Statement
2. Annexure - B, Tender Scrutiny Statement
3. Original Tenders (06 Nos.)
4. Comparative Statement

Handwritten initials and numbers at the bottom of the page.