

Ref No: SA/09/243

Date: 25-03-2009

The Project Director,
Department of Geology,
University of Karachi,
Karachi.

TENDER EVALUATION FOR BIDS OF THE PROPOSED PROJECT
"CONSTRUCTION OF NEW BLOCK IN THE
DEPARTMENT OF GEOLOGY

TENDER SCRUTINY REPORT

Dear Sir,

This is with reference to your letter Nil dated March 19, 2009.

The tender for the project were issued to Sixteen (16) Contractors, only Nine (09) participated in the competition. The original tenders were received by us on 20th March 2009 for scrutiny. The names of the contracting firms and the amount quoted by them are given below.

Positions as per tender openings statements before scrutiny:

| S # | NAME OF CONTRACTORS | REBATE | AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR) | POSITION |
|------------|---------------------------------|---------------|----------------------------------|------------------------|
| 01. | M/S. Asghar Ali & Co. | 13.981% | 13,079,892.59 | Lowest |
| 02. | M/S. Iqbal Progressive Builders | - | 13,961,605.00 | 2 nd Lowest |
| 03. | M /S. Paramount Construction | 3.50% | 14,188,500.00 | 3 rd Lowest |
| 04. | M/S. Pentagrams Enterprises | - | 14,999,999.00 | 4 th Lowest |
| 05. | M/S. Modern Dynamic Associates | - | 15,039,506.70 | 5 th Lowest |

Cont...

| S # | NAME OF CONTRACTORS | REBATE | AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR) | POSITION |
|------------|-------------------------------|---------------|----------------------------------|------------------------|
| 06. | M/S. Ahmed Hussain Jagirani | - | 15,972,852.39 | 6 th Lowest |
| 07. | M/S. Pak Arabian Construction | - | 16,137,011.00 | 7 th Lowest |
| 08. | M/S. Precise Construction | 2.50% | 16,466,678.00 | 8 th Lowest |
| 09. | M/S. Nasim & Co. (Pvt.) Ltd | - | 17,790,569.00 | 9 th Lowest |

After scrutiny and arithmetic check, the bid amount changed as given below:

| S # | NAME OF CONTRACTORS | REBATE | AMOUNT AFTER REBATE (PKR) | POSITION |
|------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------|
| 01. | M/S. Asghar Ali & Co. | 13.981% | 13,458,709.08 | Lowest |
| 02. | M/S. Iqbal Progressive Builders | - | 13,950,354.66 | 2 nd Lowest |
| 03. | M/S. Paramount Construction | 3.50% | 14,188,284.63 | 3 rd Lowest |
| 04. | M/S. Pentagrams Associates | - | 14,999,999.00 | 4 th Lowest |
| 05. | M/S. Modern Dynamic Associates | - | 15,039,506.70 | 5 th Lowest |
| 06. | M/S. Ahmed Hussain Jagirani | - | 15,972,852.39 | 6 th Lowest |
| 07. | M/S. Pak Arabian Construction | - | 16,298,438.55 | 7 th Lowest |
| 08. | M/S. Precise Construction | 2.50% | 16,697,393.51 | 8 th Lowest |
| 09. | M/S. Nasim & Co. (Pvt.) Ltd | 400,000 on Item # 40 & 6% on NSI | 17,790,569.27 | 9 th Lowest |

Cont...

The difference in the total tendered cost of different Contractors is given below.

| S# | DIFFERENCE BETWEEN | AMOUNT (PKR) | PERCENTAGE |
|-----------|--|---------------------|-------------------|
| 01. | 1 st and 2 nd Lowest | 491,645.58 | 3.52% |
| 02. | 2 nd and 3 rd Lowest | 237,929.97 | 1.68% |
| 03. | 3 rd and 4 th Lowest | 811,714.37 | 5.41% |
| 04. | 4 th and 5 th Lowest | 39,507.00 | 0.26% |
| 05. | 5 th and 6 th Lowest | 933,345.69 | 5.84% |
| 06. | 6 th and 7 th Lowest | 325,586.16 | 2.00% |
| 07. | 7 th and 8 th Lowest | 398,954.96 | 2.39% |
| 08. | 8 th and 9 th Lowest | 1,093,175.76 | 6.14% |

OBSERVATIONS:

1. M/S. Asghar Ali & Co. are the 1st lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 13,079,892.59 to Rs. 13,458,709.08 (difference: Rs. +378,816.49) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 3.52% lower than 2nd bidder.
2. M/S. Iqbal Progressive Builders are the 2nd lowest tender. Their bid amount has decreased from Rs. 13,961,605.00 to Rs. 13,950,354.66 (difference: Rs. -11,250.34) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed. They are approximately 1.68% lower than 3rd bidder. Over writing and cuttings in quoted rate have been observed on Page # 21 and Summary.
3. M/S. Paramount Construction are the 3rd lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has decreased from Rs. 14,188,500.00 to Rs. 14,188,284.63 (difference Rs. -215.37) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed after scrutiny. They are approximately 5.41% lower than 4th bidder.
4. M/S. Pentagrams Enterprises are the 4th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has not changed and also their position after scrutiny. They are approximately 0.26% lower than 5th bidder.
5. M/S. Modern Dynamic Associates are the 5th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has not changed and also their position after scrutiny. They are approximately 5.84% lower than 6th bidder.
6. M/S. Ahmed Hussain Jagirani are the 6th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has not changed and also their position after scrutiny. They are approximately 2.00% lower than 7th bidder. Over writing and cuttings in quoted rate have been observed on Summary Page.

Cont...

7. M/S. Pak Arabian Construction are the 7th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 16,137,011.00 to Rs. 16,298,438.55 (difference Rs. +161,427.55) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed. They are approximately 2.39% lower than 8th bidder. Over writing and cuttings in quoted rate have been observed on Page # 21 and Summary.
8. M/S. Precise Construction are the 8th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 16,466,678.00 to Rs. 16,697,393.51 (difference Rs.+ 230,715.51) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed. They are approximately 6.14% lower than 9th bidder.
9. M/S. Nasim & Co (Pvt.) Ltd are the 9th lowest tenderer. Their bid amount has increased from Rs. 17,790,569.00 to Rs. 17,790,569.27 (difference Rs. +0.27) due to calculations errors but their position has not changed. Over writings and cuttings in quoted rate have been observed on Summary Page.

RECOMMENDATION:

The tender of 1st lowest Contractor M/S. Asghar Ali & Co. has been further examined and it has been observed that the rates quoted by them are reasonable and workable. Their rates are 10.27% below the Estimated Cost. It is therefore, recommended that the work may awarded to them.

We are returning herewith original tenders (09 Nos.) of the above noted tenderers, duly scrutinized by us, for your necessary action.

Thanking You,

Yours Faithfully,
For **SHAHZAD ASSOCIATES**

(AKMAL JAMAL)

CC. Director (P&D) University of Karachi.

Enclosed:

1. Annexure - A, Tender Opening Statement
2. Annexure - B, Tender Scrutiny Statement
3. Original Tenders (09 Nos.)